Environmental Justice
Issue Paper
Purpose

• The Council’s 2019 **Five-Year Review** of the Delta Plan...

  • Identified EJ as a key emerging issue.

  • Recommended that staff **prepare an issue paper** "to investigate the potential need for additional strategies or responses within the Delta Plan to address disadvantaged communities and EJ.”
Environmental Justice (EJ)

- The fair treatment of people of all races, cultures, and incomes with respect to the development, adoption, implementation, and enforcement of environmental laws, regulations, and policies. (Gov. Code, § 65040.12, subd. (e)).
Objectives of EJ Issue Paper

- **Build a network** of community leaders and organizations to inform and support the Council’s EJ work;

- **Identify environmental justice issues** impacting communities in and around the Sacramento-San Joaquin Delta; and

- **Identify options** to address those issues.
Expert Group

• Barbara Barrigan-Parilla, Restore the Delta

• Bob Erlenbusch, Sacramento Regional Coalition to End Homelessness

• Matt Holmes, Little Manila Rising

• Sherri Norris, California Indian Environmental Alliance
Identifying EJ Issues in the Delta

(Word cloud of Delta EJ issues from interviews)
## Public Comment Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Representational Justice</th>
<th>Procedural Justice</th>
<th>Distributive Justice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Delta towns/ communities</td>
<td>• Language access</td>
<td>• Climate change impacts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Disadvantaged communities (DACs)</td>
<td>• Meaningful involvement</td>
<td>• Cultural resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• EJ communities</td>
<td>• Meeting support</td>
<td>• Drinking water supply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Terminology</td>
<td>• Transparency</td>
<td>• Flood risk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Tribal sovereignty</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Food access</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Vulnerable communities</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Harmful algal blooms</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
<pre><code>                                                                                       |                                                                                  | • Human right to water                                                                  |
                                                                                       |                                                                                  | • Job access                                                                          |
                                                                                       |                                                                                  | • Levee investments                                                                    |
                                                                                       |                                                                                  | • Public health                                                                       |
                                                                                       |                                                                                  | • Subsistence fishing                                                                  |
                                                                                       |                                                                                  | • Tribal cultural resources                                                            |
                                                                                       |                                                                                  | • Urban development                                                                    |
                                                                                       |                                                                                  | • Water affordability                                                                  |
                                                                                       |                                                                                  | • Water quality                                                                        |
</code></pre>
Seminar Series with EJ Scholars

**WATER JUSTICE**

Dr. Kristen Dobbin (UC Berkeley) & Laurel Firestone (State Water Board)

**REPRESENTATIONAL JUSTICE**

Dr. Jill Harrison (CU Boulder)

**INDIGENOUS JUSTICE**

Dr. Kyle Whyte (U. Michigan)

**REDLINING & FLOODING JUSTICE**

Dr. Raoul Lievanos (U. Oregon)
In-Depth Interviews

Stockton Environmental Justice Initiative (CalEPA)
Overview of Interviews

• **22 interviews** with EJ and community-based organizations
• Targeted **issue diversity** and **regional geographic** coverage

### Interviewees' focus areas:
- General EJ
- Water
- Public health
- Jobs/ workforce training/ education
- Housing & unhoused communities
- Basic services (healthcare, food, housing)
- Latino/a advocacy
- Outdoor/ recreation access
- Tribes & indigenous groups
- Disability justice
- Local service providers

### Geographic coverage of interviewees:
- Interior Delta (n = 2)
- Sacramento (n = 4)
- Stockton (n = 6)
- Contra Costa County (n = 4)
- Bay Area (n = 3)
- Statewide (n = 3)
“Everything is connected. When you change one thing, it will change another. We must use that intersection to build [broader] community with groups that are not explicitly focused on the issue at hand.”
“Everything is connected. When you change one thing, it will change another. We must use that intersection to build [broader] community with groups that are not explicitly focused on the issue at hand.”
Representational Justice: Communities Impacted by EJ Issues in the Delta

- Minority communities/communities of people of color
- Low-income communities
- Tribes and Indigenous communities
- Immigrant communities
- Undocumented immigrants
- Renters
- Unhoused communities
- Food insecure communities
- Youth (youth at risk, foster youth)
- Elders/seniors
- People with disabilities
- LGBTQ+
- Delta legacy town residents

SB 535 Disadvantaged Communities: Census Tracts & Tribal Areas (CalEPA, 2022)

Social Vulnerability to Climate Change in the Delta (Delta Adapts, 2021)

### Trust barrier
- Disenfranchisement & distrust
- “Box-checking”

### Technical knowledge barrier
- Unfamiliarity with issues
- Technocratic approaches

### Capacity barriers
- Meeting time/location/technology requirements
- Time limitations
- Financial hardship

---

“**There’s so many agencies that want to help but it’s a lot of lip service or they just disappear. You can only have so many meetings before you think, “when is something tangible actually going to happen?”**

“**Meet people where they are. Address immediate issues [first], before people can care about bigger picture/longer-term issues. Bring together people that have trusted relationships with residents and trained organizers.”**
Distributive Justice: Water

Water supply:
• Water rights priority system
• Insufficient in-Delta flows
• Impacts versus benefits of Conveyance

Water quality:
• Agricultural pollution and industrial contaminants
• Harmful algal blooms
• Poor groundwater quality

Water affordability:
• Water rates & rate structures
• Insufficient funding for water systems to address concerns

“...[We] send water away from the Delta, while communities in the Delta...[have] water barely above acceptable standards for drinking.”

“A day will come when water is the highest cost commodity. Those who can afford it will, and those who can't will get substandard water to drink.”
Human Right to Water Violations in the Delta

- Across 5 Delta counties, 99 Community Water Systems, serving 188,000 people are failing, at risk or potentially at risk of failing HR2W standards:
  - 19 systems (89,000 people) failing
  - 39 systems (37,000 people) at risk of failing
  - 41 systems (62,000 people) potential at risk of failing

CA Drinking Water Needs Assessment (SWRCB, updated May 2022)
EXPERT PERSPECTIVE:
Restore the Delta
Distributive justice: Pollution exposure & public health inequities

- **Historic redlining** and present-day **land use planning** resulting in disproportionate exposure to environmental harms

- Long-term, generational **health impacts due to pollution exposure**, lack of access to health services, public transport, & healthy food

“Everything in EJ is intersectional – affordable housing, vulnerable communities, public health, air pollution, inequity.”
Redlining Histories and Cumulative Pollution Burden in the Delta

Redlining maps (CalEPA, Pollution and Prejudice)

Cumulative Pollution Burden (CA OEHHA, CalEnviroScreen 4.0)
EXPERT PERSPECTIVE:
Little Manila Rising
Stockton’s Little Manila
Marginalization, Resilience, & Renaissance
Amazon Fulfillment Center

Port Of Stockton

Growing Airport

Converging Rail

3 Major Freeways
Stationary Sources of Pollution in AB617
One Lonely air now Monitor
Distribution of Monitors

Current Monitor locations
(approx 17 w/ 7 located at All Saints)

70 Additional Monitors to be distributed across Stockton
Current Dispersion Modeling

Current Air Quality

Primary Pollutant
This pollutant currently has the highest AQI in the area.

- OZONE  31  Good
  Enjoy your outdoor activities.

- PM2.5  15  Good
Community Air Monitoring Plan
Stockton Skywatch
Little Manila

• Follow us on Social Media
@littlemanilastockton #StocktonSkywatch
Skywatch Elements

Little Manilla RISING

Air Monitoring
Job training & Academic Partnerships
Biomonitoring
Behavioral Interventions
Electrification Equity Advocacy
Policy Watchdog

Community Air Monitoring:
A Remote Sensor Network of PurpleAir particulate sensors will form the backbone of our air quality (AQ) work by monitoring the air we breathe, block-by-block, and in real-time to inform residents. Currently, Central California Asthma Collaborative has provided 12 initial monitors that are collecting baseline and reference data. These are currently (6) calibrated sensors online and live at PurpleAir.org; (6) more are slated for key emission sources.

Behavioral Interventions
Partnering with Central Valley Air Quality Coalition (CVAQ) to distribute Wildfire “Protect Yourself” information and N95 masks to “hard to reach” migrant farm workers. We’re delivering personal protective equipment and ensure your right information so that farm workers can protect themselves when their employers fail to do so.

Electrical Vehicle Equity
Personal Cars - Little Manilla Rising is partnering with the Central California Asthma Collaborative (CCAC) on their Electrical Vehicle (EV) Equity program. We are integrating public information from the Evec Equity program into our existing Outreach and engagement programs to help identify underserved communities who are disproportionately impacted by transportation burdens. Many of our neighbors are already eligible for existing funding through the state, the automobile retail industry, and the San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District to ensure that our residents are not left behind during the electric vehicle Revolution.

Policy Reform
Little Manilla Rising’s role on the Stockton AB617 Community Steering Committee has established us as a leading voice around environmental justice, regional air quality, and statewide climate change policy.

Delta Stewardship Council (DSC) - Environmental Justice Policy Statement. Building on our successful rollout of the DSC’s Climate Vulnerability Assessment this past spring, we have been engaged to help draft a policy statement to ensure vulnerable communities in the Delta region become valued stakeholders.

CARB’s AB617 - South-Stockton Community Emissions Reduction Plan (CERP). With the CERP Implementation Phase underway we chair multiple subcommittees to maintain guardrails in the implementation of AB617 to ensure that our hard-won victories are delivered as promised by the San Joaquin Valley Air Pollution Control District.

CARB’s AB32 - Environmental Justice Advisory Committee (EJAC). Executive Director Dillen Delvalle was nominated and appointed to EJAC who has statutory authority to approve or reject the State of California Carbon Neutrality Sourcing Plan. This statewide policy has major implications for Stockton as the plan not only calls for nature-based solutions, and emissions reductions, it also hopes to accelerate carbon neutrality by burying massive CO2 Emissions 6,000 Feet under the Delta.

Skywatch Elements

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA

MERCED

Job Training & Academic Partnerships
In partnership with UC Merced and the CA Department of Justice, Little Manilla Rising will deploy an additional 70 remote sensors across South Stockton as part of a larger (158) sensor array stretching South along the I-5 & 99 corridor to characterize Transportation Related Air Pollution (TRAPS).

Deployment of the sensors will allow us to develop an Environmental Monitoring career pathway that bridges the public health, technology, and utility sectors so that we can create meaningful and lasting jobs that serve and protect our communities.

OEHHA

California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessments (OEHHA) is partnering with Little Manilla Rising to facilitate a “Biomonitoring” study in a South Stockton Elementary School. Biomonitoring entails comparative urine analyses that demonstrate the benefits of designing air filtration in schools with scientific control measures that assure both the sufficient fresh air intake mandated by AB 841 and which mitigates the chronic air pollution in our AB617 defined study area.

Skywatch Elements

CVAQ

Central California Asthma Collaborative

CLEAN POWER ILLINOIS

World Resources Institute

WORLD RESOURCES INSTITUTE
Stockton’s Little Manila
Marginalization, Resilience, & Renaissance
Distributive Justice: Housing Injustices & Unhoused Communities

- Unaffordable housing and necessities
- **Lack of sanitation resources** led to health hazards and impact water quality for unhoused neighbors
- Unhoused communities blamed for starting fires, led to air quality and safety concerns
- Encampments near levees pose safety risk from flood risk, also access concern during emergencies

“Lack of shelters and affordable housing... spill over into lack of sanitation, water quality, and public health issues. Thousands of people [sleep] outside and [the government] is not being proactive on the issue.”
Increasing Unhoused Population in Sacramento County

- Early 2022 survey estimated 9,278 individuals experiencing homelessness throughout Sacramento County
- **67% increase** in nightly homelessness since the last survey count in 2019
- **Highest estimate on record** of unhoused individuals per capita in Sacramento County

Estimates of unhoused individuals in Sacramento County 2015-2022
(“Homelessness in Sacramento County 2022 Report”, CSUS)
EXPERT PERSPECTIVE:
Sacramento Regional Coalition to End Homelessness
Indigenous & Tribal injustices

• Lack of recognition of **tribal sovereignty**, preservation, and Traditional Knowledge

• **Marginalization and exclusion** from decision-making processes and **inadequate Tribal Consultation**

• Disproportionate exposure to **environmental hazards**—water contamination, heat, air and noise pollution

“This has become agencies telling the Tribes what they intend to do, but not providing opportunity for ‘free and prior informed consent’ to the action”
Indigenous Ancestral Lands in the Delta

Tribal ancestral lands in CA (parks.ca.gov)

Tribal ancestral lands in Northern-Central CA (native-lands.ca)
EXPERT PERSPECTIVE: California Indian Environmental Alliance
Key Takeaways

• **EJ issues in the Delta are wide-reaching, encompassing topics** very familiar to the Council, and areas traditionally outside of the Council's scope

• **EJ issues are extremely interconnected**; thus directions forward will need to be innovative, collaborative and multi-scale

• **EJ action is needed on multiple fronts**: government-community relations, public engagement, research, environmental monitoring and data collection in overburdened communities, analysis of policy options, planning, regulation, enforcement

• **EJ organizations were happy to share their experiences** and expertise and pleased to see Council’s efforts starting with listening to communities

“We need champions to push for change from within the system.”
Next Steps and Timeline

FALL 2022
• Finalize interview data analysis
• Community engagement and input on issues and recommendations
• Develop recommendations based on interview data and Expert Group

WINTER 2023
• Drafting of issue paper in collaboration with Expert Group

SPRING 2023
• Finalize issue paper, Council consideration of options
Thank you

Connect with us

@DeltaCouncil
@deltastewardshipcouncil
Delta Stewardship Council
@deltastewardshipcouncil
Deltacouncil.ca.gov

Scan the QR code to subscribe to our listserv